## The role of symmetry in the mass independent isotope effect in ozone

Greg Michalski<sup>a,1</sup> and S. K. Bhattacharya<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Department of Chemistry, Purdue University, 550 Stadium Mall Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907; and <sup>b</sup>Physical Research Laboratory, Navrangpura, Ahmedabad 380009, India

Edited by Mark H. Thiemens, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, CA, and approved February 20, 2009 (received for review December 15, 2008)

Understanding the internal distribution of "anomalous" isotope enrichments has important implications for validating theoretical postulates on the origin of these enrichments in molecules such as ozone and for understanding the transfer of these enrichments to other compounds in the atmosphere via mass transfer. Here, we present an approach, using the reaction  $NO_2^- + O_3$ , for assessing the internal distribution of the  $\Delta^{17}O$  anomaly and the  $\delta^{18}O$  enrichment in ozone produced by electric discharge. The  $\Delta^{17}O$  results strongly support the symmetry mechanism for generating mass independent fractionations, and the  $\delta^{18}O$  results are consistent with published data. Positional  $\Delta^{17}O$  and  $\delta^{18}O$  enrichments in ozone can now be more effectively used in photochemical models that use mass balance oxygen atom transfer mechanisms to infer atmospheric oxidation chemistry.

oxygen | nitrate | nitrite | oxidation

**R** ecently, there has been considerable interest in using oxygen isotopes found in photochemically active compounds to trace chemical reactions in the atmosphere (see reviews in refs.1-3). This includes the use of traditional approaches that utilize kinetic and equilibrium isotope effects that occur during chemical reactions and phase changes. But there are also some promising new advances using "anomalous" oxygen isotope signatures (2): anomalous meaning isotope distributions that cannot be predicted by means of the usual statistical and quantum mechanical techniques (4). For oxygen, the anomaly is defined as the excess <sup>17</sup>O over what is expected based on <sup>18</sup>O isotopic abundances. This excess  $^{17}$ O is quantified by  $\Delta^{17}$ O  $\approx$  $\delta^{17}O - 0.52\delta^{18}O$  or more precisely using natural log scales (5). The process, or processes, that generate  $\Delta^{17}O$  signals have been termed mass-independent fractionations (MIF) (2, 6) because the enrichments appear to scale irrespective of the relative mass differences of <sup>17</sup>O with respect to <sup>18</sup>O when referenced to <sup>16</sup>O. They have also been referred to as "strange isotope effects" (7) and non-mass-dependent (NOMAD) (8, 9).

The most thoroughly studied MIF system is that of ozone formation. Ozone generated by electric discharge or UV photolysis can produce  $\Delta^{17}$ O values of 30–40% (%) = parts per thousand). There have also been numerous studies that have experimentally quantified the pressure and temperature dependence of the isotopic enrichments (10, 11). Most recently, the transfer of the  $\Delta^{17}$ O anomaly from ozone to other compounds during oxidation reactions (via atom transfer, e.g., mass balance) has been used to elucidate chemical oxidation pathways in modern atmospheres (16–21). These include  $\Delta^{17}$ O observations in atmospheric nitrate, sulfate, CO<sub>2</sub>, and N<sub>2</sub>O.  $\Delta^{17}$ O variations in atmospheric nitrate and sulfate are intriguing because they have opened the possibility of using these  $\Delta^{17}$ O variations in ice cores as a proxy for paleo-oxidation chemistry (22, 23). Modeling such transfer reactions, however, requires knowledge of the internal distribution of the  $\Delta^{17}O$  anomaly, i.e., how much is contained in the central versus terminal atoms of ozone, because many atmospheric oxidations are thought to occur through terminal-only transition states.

Theories as to the origin of the MIF effect have taken many turns (7, 8, 24, 25), and some theories seem more adept at handling specific experimental cases than others. Most have symmetry as the main, albeit ad hoc, causal mechanism for producing MIF. Recent work by Marcus and coworkers (26–28) is perhaps the most thorough treatment, and they have suggested that nonstatistical RRKM effects arise because of differences in the rovibronic coupling efficiency of the asymmetric molecule when compared with the symmetric isomer. Recent NO<sub>2</sub> spectroscopic data appear to bear the theory out (29), but the uncertainties in that study remain significant, and no mass spectrometer isotope data on the unimolecular decay of NO<sub>2</sub> are available. Because the basis of the ozone MIF theory is symmetry driven, it is implied that the anomalous enrichment must be contained in the terminal atoms of ozone. To be clear, there maybe overall isotopic enrichment ( $\delta^{18}O$ ,  $\delta^{17}O$ ) distributed throughout the molecule based on isotopologue zero-point energy differences (30), but the <sup>17</sup>O excess ( $\Delta^{17}$ O) is expected to be only in the terminal position. Others, however, have argued against the symmetry theory (31-33) and have placed anomalous enrichments, even negative  $\Delta^{17}$ O values (34), throughout ozone in an attempt to reconcile experimental observations. Precise and accurate measurements of ozone's  $\Delta^{17}O$  internal distribution is therefore needed to test the symmetry hypothesis and for accurate modeling of transfer reactions in the atmosphere. Here, we present these measurements using a relatively simple analytical technique.

The internal distribution of oxygen isotopes in ozone was determined by taking advantage of an isotope transfer reaction. The challenge in using this approach is that the reaction must be quantitative (go to completion), there can be no isotopic exchange with spectator compounds or reaction intermediates, and there must be some experimental or theoretical evidence of the transition state structure or the branching ratios of the reaction. Recent works examining  $\Delta^{17}$ O transfer reactions were limited in that they did not meet all of these criteria (35, 36). The aqueous phase oxidation reaction  $NO_2^- + O_3 \rightarrow NO_3^- + O_2$  was used in the present work. This is a very rapid reaction  $(5.83 \times 10^5)$  $M^{-1}s^{-1}$ ) that quickly goes to completion, and previous studies by Liu et al. showed that this was a oxygen atom transfer reaction (37). In addition, their ab initio calculations showed that the reaction pathway proceeded through an adduct conformation where the  $NO_2^-$  only abstracted the terminal atom (37) from the ozone molecule (Fig. 1). Control experiments carried out in this work using  $NO_2^-$  solutions mixed with isotopically unique waters showed that no water molecules were incorporated into the product  $NO_3^-$  or  $O_2$  at the conclusion of the experiments. Furthermore, both of the products (O<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) are resilient to water exchange in solution over 1,000-year time scales. The

Author contributions: G.M. designed research; G.M. and S.K.B. performed research; G.M. contributed new reagents/analytic tools; G.M. and S.K.B. analyzed data; and G.M. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: gmichals@purdue.edu.



Fig. 1. Transition state of the  $O_3 + NO_2^-$  reaction showing terminal atom extraction. From Liu et al. (37).

terminal-only transition state, rapid reactivity, and lack of isotopic exchange make the  $NO_2^- + O_3$  an ideal system to probe ozone's internal isotopic distribution.

## **Results and Discussion**

To test the symmetry hypothesis, the isotopic composition of the O2 product is measured with respect to the initial ozone for each experiment. If the  $\Delta^{17}O$  anomaly is statistically distributed throughout the molecule, then the product O2 would have the same  $\Delta^{17}$ O value as the initial ozone. If, however, the anomaly is located only in the terminal atom, then the product  $O_2 \Delta^{17}O$ value will be 3/4 of the O<sub>3</sub>  $\Delta^{17}$ O value (see *Methods*). Fig. 2 shows the  $\Delta^{17}$ O correlation plot of the measured O<sub>2</sub> relative to that predicted based on the measured bulk  $O_3 \Delta^{17}O$  value and assuming  $\Delta^{17}$ O resides only in the terminal atom. The regression of 0.86 and  $r^2 = 0.98$  value is close to a 1:1 correspondence between the terminal only hypothesis and the  $O_2 \Delta^{17}O$  observations. If 2 of the data points are excluded, then the regression improves to 0.95. The average difference between the terminal atom hypothesis and the observed  $O_2\,\Delta^{17}O$  value is 0.55% o with a standard deviation of  $\pm 0.88\%$  (n = 14). The negligible scatter in the data and the offset is likely due to a small percentage of the ozone breaking down on the reaction chamber walls, which would lead to an increase in the  $O_2 \Delta^{17}O$  value. In contrast, assuming an approximately statistical distribution of  $\Delta^{17}O$ among all atoms the O<sub>2</sub> generated would be 33% more enriched than our observations. This strongly suggests that the terminal atom possesses the  $\Delta^{17}$ O anomaly in agreement with recent spectroscopic studies (38) and is similar to conclusions based on



**Fig. 2.** Measured  $\Delta^{17}$ O in product O<sub>3</sub> versus  $\Delta^{17}$ O model (solid diamonds) assuming only the terminal atom contains the anomaly (i.e., O<sub>2</sub> = <sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub>O<sub>3</sub>). (*Inset*) Rayleigh distillation of O<sub>3</sub> (open triangle) produced using O<sub>2</sub> (filled diamond) then distilled at 77 K and collected in 4 separate fractions (open triangles). The 2 largest  $\Delta^{17}$ O values are  $\approx 2\%$  enriched over the modeled value which, if excluded, would improve the correlation to  $R^2 = 0.95$ .

studies of oxidation of silver by ozone (35), and the mechanism suggested in the non-RRKM model (7, 26). We note that when trying to produce small  $\Delta^{17}$ O values by manipulation at very low pressures and prolonged discharge times part of the  $\Delta^{17}$ O begins to shift to the central position. Such extreme conditions are not realized in the atmosphere and would not be of relevance for modeling of  $\Delta^{17}$ O transfer during oxidation reactions in the stratosphere or troposphere.

Evaluation of the positional dependence of the <sup>18</sup>O enrichments is more complex because one must distinguish between the  $\delta^{18}$ O generated during the O<sub>3</sub> formation process and the changes in the  $\delta^{18}$ O via kinetic or equilibrium effects arising during the oxidation experiment. For example, there may be a mass-dependent alteration in the ozone  $\delta^{18}$ O values by incomplete trapping in the flow system at 77 K. This can be seen in the Fig. 2 Inset. The data show a control experiment where the initial  $O_2$  (solid diamond) is partially converted to  $O_3$  (product  $O_3$  is connected to  $O_2$  via the dashed line). The vapor pressure of  $O_3$ at 77 K is  $\approx$ 3 millitorr, and this small gaseous component of the total O<sub>3</sub> was collected in 4 stages as a function of time onto a molecular sieve. The resulting fractionation gives a  $\delta^{17}$ O vs.  $\delta^{18}$ O slope of 0.5277, showing that the ozone evaporative process follows a normal, isotopic mass-dependant equilibrium vapor pressure law. This means that although the  $\delta^{18}$ O may be altered by incomplete trapping, the process is mass dependent, and the  $\Delta^{17}$ O value is conserved (Fig. 2). However, this should be a small  $\delta^{18}$ O effect because O<sub>3</sub> production rate, based on a function of the flow rates and times of collection, suggests that the partial pressure of  $O_3$  was  $\approx 300$  millitorr (99% trapping efficiency). Similarly, in the reaction between  $O_3$  and  $NO_2^-$ , there will be different mass-dependent kinetic isotope effects (KIE) during each of the bond-breaking reaction pathways: O-O-18O (asym-1), <sup>18</sup>O—O—O (asym-2), and O—<sup>18</sup>O—O (sym). As a result of the small isotope effects associated with the O<sub>3</sub> collection and KIE of the reaction, the  $\delta^{18}$ O value of our product O<sub>2</sub> is a function of both the initial isotopic distribution in ozone and these processes. These isotope effects, however, are typically much smaller than the high isotopic enrichments observed during ozone formation, so it is still informative to examine the results of <sup>18</sup>O in these experiments given these limitations.

Recent work by Janssen (30) examined the isotopic branching ratio for the symmetric and asymmetric isotopologues, called the  $r_{50}$  (ratio of mass 50), which statistically should be equal to 2. We used a quadratic fit of Janssen's  $r_{50}$  data relative to his measured  $O_3$  bulk enrichment, then used that equation to calculate  $r_{50}$ using our bulk ozone  $\delta^{18}$ O values, and from that the expected  $\delta^{18}$ O value of O<sub>2</sub> in our experiments. The measured O<sub>2</sub>  $\delta^{18}$ O values in this work were offset by  $-3.9\% \pm 2.7\%$  relative to the quadratic fit. This is in fairly good agreement with spectroscopic evaluations of the positional dependence of the <sup>18</sup>O enrichment considering the experimental uncertainty in those experiments is on the order of  $\approx 6\%$  (38). From a kinetic perspective, the <sup>18</sup>O is more likely to be incorporated into the more strongly bonded  $NO_3^-$  (symmetric 2 pathway) leaving product  $O_2$  depleted in <sup>18</sup>O, which may explain the -3.9% offset. Such a small KIE would not be surprising. One of the most important KIE mass-dependent factors, collisional frequency, is the same for the single isotopic substituted isomers (doubly substituted are statistically negligible). Second, the ground state zero point energy of the asymmetric isotopologue is the same for either pathway (asym-1, asym-2), so this important factor is negated in the branching ratio rates. Therefore, only a small contribution of the transition state vibrational frequencies and the zero point energy difference in the symmetric isotopologue will contribute to the KIE of the reaction. After correcting the O<sub>2</sub>  $\delta^{18}$ O data by using this -3.9% KIE, the  $\delta^{18}$ O values in the present work agree with Janssen's review to within  $\pm 3\%$ . Using these results, we have formulated an empirical linear fit of the  $\delta^{18}$ O terminal and



Fig. 3. Empirical relationship between the  $\delta^{18}$ O value of the terminal and central atoms of the ozone molecule with respect to the bulk O<sub>3</sub>  $\delta^{18}$ O values expected under tropospheric/stratospheric conditions.

 $\delta^{18}$ O central for O<sub>3</sub> relative to the bulk ozone enrichment by using Janssen's  $r_{50}$  values and our corrected O<sub>2</sub>  $\delta^{18}$ O enrichments values (Fig. 3; see *Methods*). When we compare terminal atom  $\delta^{18}$ O values using our linear fit relative to those derived with the quadratic fit given by Janssen, the correlation between the 2 values are essentially identical with a  $R^2 = 0.9999$  (related by 0.7955x + 10.714, where x is our  $\delta^{18}$ O value).

The reaction  $NO_2^- + O_3$  was used to determine the internal distribution of the  $\Delta^{17}O$  anomaly and the  $\delta^{18}O$  partitioning within the ozone molecule. The data show that the  $\Delta^{17}O$  anomaly is indeed found in the terminal position in agreement with the most recent theoretical assertions (26–28). Our estimates of the positional dependence of the <sup>18</sup>O enrichments are also in good agreement with other investigators (39). We conclude that although the overall isotopic enrichment is distributed throughout the ozone molecule, there is an anomalous excess in the terminal atoms. These findings should improve the photochemical modeling of  $\Delta^{17}O$  transfer reactions such as  $CO_2 + O^1D$ exchange (40, 41) and NO<sub>x</sub> conversion to HNO<sub>3</sub> (16, 36). We note, however, that most of the  $\Delta^{17}O$  values measured in tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> (12,14) fall outside their expected values based

- Mauersberger K, Krankowsky D, Janssen C (2003) Oxygen isotope processes and transfer reactions. Space Sci Rev 106:265–279.
- 2. Thiemens MH (2005) A survey of mass independent isotope effects in nature. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 69:A443.
- Brenninkmeijer CAM, et al. (2003) Isotope effects in the chemistry of atmospheric trace compounds. Chem Rev 103:5125–5161.
- Young ED, Galy A, Nagahara H (2002) Kinetic and equilibrium mass-dependent isotope fractionation laws in nature and their geochemical and cosmochemical significance. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 66:1095–1104.
- Miller MF (2002) Isotopic fractionation and the quantification of <sup>17</sup>O anomalies in the oxygen three-isotope system: An appraisal and geochemical significance. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 66:1881–1889.
- Thiemens M, Farquhar J, Bao H, Savarino J (2001) Mass independent isotope effects: Theory and applications. Acc Chem Rev 34:645–652.
- Gao YQ, Marcus RA (2002) On the theory of the strange and unconventional isotopic effects in ozone formation. J Chem Phys 116:137–154.
- Heidenreich JE, III, Thiemens MH (1983) A non-mass-dependent isotope effect in the production of ozone from molecular oxygen. J Chem Phys 78:892–895.
- Assonov SS, Brenninkmeijer CAM (2005) Reporting small ∆<sup>17</sup>O values: Existing definitions and concepts. Rapid Commun Mass Spec 19:627–636.
- Thiemens MH, Heidenreich JE, III (1983) The mass-independent fractionation of oxygen: A novel isotope effect and its possible cosmochemical implications. Science 219:1073–1075.
- Thiemens MH, Jackson T (1990) Pressure dependency for heavy isotope enhancement in ozone formation. Geophys Res Lett 17:717–719.
- 12. Johnston JC, Thiemens MH (1997) The isotopic composition of tropospheric ozone in three environments. J Geophys Res 102:25395–25404.

on temperature and pressure dependencies of formation (11, 30, 39, 42). Using quadratic fits of Morton et al.'s data, and using temperature and pressures typical of conditions during the tropospheric ozone measurements of Johnston and Thiemens, we derive expected  $\delta^{18}$ O values of 75–85‰ (relative to air O<sub>2</sub>), which are similar to, but offset from, the observed 70–97‰ values. Using the same approach, the expected ozone  $\Delta^{17}$ O values of 26 ± 4‰ (12). This is a serious limitation and needs to be resolved before any climatic or chemical interpretation of  $\Delta^{17}$ O transfer models can be considered valid. We note that the  $\Delta^{17}$ O signal is transferred to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> during the NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> + O<sub>3</sub> reaction and that this may be an experimental approach for assessing tropospheric  $\Delta^{17}$ O variations.

## Methods

Ozone was produced by electric discharge in a flow system where the  $\Delta^{17}O$  anomaly and  $\delta^{18}O$  composition was varied by altering the  $O_2$  pressure and temperature at the discharge interface. The ozone was collected downstream by using a liquid nitrogen trap. The system was then evacuated (10<sup>-4</sup> torr) and the ozone thawed to room temperature. An aliquot of  $O_3$  was collected on a molecular sieve for isotopic analysis. The remaining ozone (~100  $\mu$ mol) was transferred to a reaction tube containing 1 mL of a 1 M NO\_2^ solution that had been previously degassed of dissolved  $O_2$  (no  $O_2$  could be detected after degassing step). The 10:1 NO\_2^/O\_3 ratio ensures a rapid, complete reaction ( $\tau$  ~ 0.02 s) and limits  $O_3$  breakdown on reaction vessel walls. Yields based on product  $O_2$  pressure were always >95%. The product  $O_2$  was collected for isotopic analysis, which was conducted at the Purdue Stable Isotope (PSI) facility by using a Thermo DeltaV isotope ratio mass spectrometer. The ln form of the  $\Delta^{17}O$  equation [In(1,000 +  $\delta^{17}O$ ) – 0.52(In(1,000 +  $\delta^{18}O$ )] was used for all data.

The derivation of the  $\Delta^{17}$ O of O<sub>2</sub> being 3/4 of O<sub>3</sub> bulk  $\Delta^{17}$ O rule is as follows: Assuming the  $\Delta^{17}O$  enrichment is statistically distributed the isotope mass balance dictates that  $\Delta^{17}O_{bulk} = 1/3 \Delta^{17}O_{central} + 2/3\Delta^{17}O_{terminal}$  (1). The use of the model that the  $\Delta^{17}$ O is only in the terminal position means the  $\Delta^{17}$ O<sub>central</sub> term is equal to zero and solving for  $\Delta^{17}O_{\text{terminal}}$  yields  $\Delta^{17}O_{\text{terminal}} = 3/2\Delta^{17}O_{\text{bulk}}$ . Because the O<sub>2</sub> formed by the transition state in Fig. 1 acquires 1 oxygen atom from the central position and 1 from the terminal position then  $\Delta^{17}O_{O2}$  $\frac{1}{2}(3/2\Delta^{17}O_{bulk}) + \frac{1}{2}(\Delta^{17}O_{central}) = 3/4\Delta^{17}O_{bulk}$ , because  $\Delta^{17}O_{central}$  is taken to be zero in ref. 1. For determining ozone's  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  terminal and central enrichment we also start with statistical isotopic mass balance:  $\delta^{18}O_{bulk} = 1/3(\delta^{18}O_{cent}) + 2/3(\delta^{18}O_{t-1})$ erminal) (2) and deviation from this statistical assumption by  $r_{50} = 2(\delta^{18}O_{term} +$ 1)/( $\delta^{18}O_{cent}$  + 1) (3). Using bulk ozone  $\delta^{18}O$  values and Janssen's  $r_{50}$  values, one can solve for the expected  $\delta^{18}O_{terminal}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{central}$ . Again using the Fig. 1 transition state, the product O\_2  $\delta^{18}O$  value can be derived from  $\frac{1}{2}\,\delta^{18}O_{terminal}+\frac{1}{2}\,\delta^{18}O_{central}$ ] and compared with our data. The -3.9% offset is corrected in the data as the reaction KIE and Fig. 3 is generated by plotting  $\delta^{18}O_{terminal}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{central}$  versus the measured ozone  $\delta^{18}O_{bulk}$  with the error bars being the observed deviation in the  $O_2 \; \delta^{18}O$  data from the expected values.

- Mauersberger K, Lammerzahl P, Krankowsky D. (2001) Stratospheric ozone isotope enrichments-revisited. *Geophys Res Lett* 28:3155–3158.
- Krankowsky D, et al. (1995) Measurement of heavy isotope enrichment in tropospheric ozone. *Geophys Res Lett* 22:1713–1716.
- Mauersberger K, Morton J, Schueler B, Stehr J, Anderson SM (1993) Multi-isotope study of ozone—Implications for the heavy ozone anomaly. *Geophys Res Lett* 20:1031–1034.
- Michalski G, Scott Z, Kabiling M, Thiemens M (2003) First measurements and modeling of Δ<sup>17</sup>O in atmospheric nitrate. *Geophys Res Lett* 30:1870.
- McCabe JR, Thiemens MH, Savarino J (2007) A record of ozone variability in South Pole Antarctic snow: Role of nitrate oxygen isotopes. J Geophys Res 1:12:D12303.
- Morin S, et al. (2008) Tracing the origin and fate of NO<sub>x</sub> in the Arctic atmosphere using stable isotopes in nitrate. *Science* 322(5902):730–732.
- Savarino J, Kaiser J, Morin S, Sigman DM, Thiemens (2006) Nitrogen and oxygen isotopic constraints on the origin of atmospheric nitrate in coastal Antarctica. *Atms Chem Phys* 7:1925–1945.
- Alexander B, et al. (2005) Sulfate formation in sea-salt aerosols: Constraints from oxygen isotopes. J Geophys Res 110:D10307.
- Savarino J, Lee CCW, Thiemens MH (2000) Laboratory oxygen isotopic study of sulfur (IV) oxidation: Origin of the mass-independent oxygen isotopic anomaly in atmospheric sulfates and sulfate mineral deposits on Earth. J Geophys Res 105:29079–29088.
- Alexander B, et al. (2003) East Antarctic ice core sulfur isotope measurements over a complete glacial-interglacial cycle. J Geophys Res 108:D003513.
- Alexander B, Savarino J, Barkov NI, Delmas RJ, Thiemens MH (2002) Climate driven changes in the oxidation pathways of atmospheric sulfur. *Geophys Res Lett* 29:1681– 1685.

- Gellene GI (1996) An explanation for symmetry-induced isotopic fractionation in ozone. Science 274:1344–1346.
- Valentini JJ (1987) Mass-independent isotopic fractionation in nonadiabatic molecularcollisions. J Chem Phys 86:6757–6765.
- Hathorn BC, Marcus RA (1999) An intramolecular theory of the mass-independent isotope effect for ozone. I. J Chem Phys 111:4087–4100.
- Hathorn BC, Marcus RA (2000) An intramolecular theory of the mass-independent isotope effect for ozone. II. Numerical implementation at low pressures using a loose transition state. J Chem Phys 113:9497–9509.
- Gao YQ, Marcus RA (2001) Strange and unconventional isotope effects in ozone formation. *Science* 293:259–263.

- Jost R, Michalski G, Thiemens M (2005) Comparison of rovibronic density of asymmetric versus symmetric NO<sub>2</sub> isotopologues at dissociation threshold: Broken symmetry effects. J Chem Phys 123:054320.
- Janssen C, Guenther J, Mauersberger K, Krankowsky D (2001) Kinetic origin of the ozone isotope effect: A critical analysis of enrichments and rate coefficients. *Phys Chem Chem Phys* 3:4718–4721.
- Janssen C (2001) Does symmetry drive isotopic anomalies in ozone isotopomer formation? Science 294:951A
- Mauersberger K, Erbacher B, Krankowsky D, Gunther J, Nickel R (1999) Ozone isotope enrichment: Isotopomer-specific rate coefficients. *Science* 283:370–372.
- Anderson SM, Hulsebusch D, Mauersberger K (1997) Surprising rate coefficients for four isotopic variants of O+O<sub>2</sub>+M. J Chem Phys 107:5385–5392.

- Lyons JR (2001) Transfer of mass-independent fractionation in ozone to other oxygencontaining radicals in the atmosphere. *Geophys Res Lett* 28:3231–3234.
- Bhattacharya SK, Pandey A, Savarino J (2008) Determination of intramolecular isotope distribution of ozone by oxidation reaction with silver metal. J Geophys Res 113:D03303.
- 36. Savarino J, Bhattacharya SK, Morin S, Baroni M, Doussin JF (2008) The NO+O<sub>3</sub> reaction: A triple oxygen isotope perspective on the reaction dynamics and atmospheric implications for the transfer of the ozone isotope anomaly. J Chem Phys 128:194303.
- Liu Q, Schurter LM, Muller CE, Aloisio S, Francisco js, Margerum DW (2001) Kinetics and mechanisms of aqueous ozone reactions with bromide, sulfite, hydrogen sulfite, iodide, and nitrite ions. *Inorg Chem* 40:4436–4442.
- Tuzson B, Janssen C (2006) Unambiguous identification of <sup>17</sup>O containing ozone isotopomers for symmetry selective detection. *Isoto Envir Health Stud* 42:67–75.
- Janssen C, Guenther J, Krankowsky D, Mauersberger K (2003) Temperature dependence of ozone rate coefficients and isotopologue fractionation in <sup>16</sup>O-<sup>18</sup>O oxygen mixtures. *Chem Phys Lett* 367:34–38.
- Thiemens MH, Jackson T, Mauersberger K, Schueler B, Morton J (1991) Oxygen isotope fractionation in stratospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Geophys Res Lett 18:669–672.
- Yung YL, DeMore WB, Pinto JP (1991) Isotopic exchange between carbon dioxide and ozone via Q(<sup>1</sup>D) in the stratosphere. *Geophys Res Lett* 18:13–16.
- Morton J, Barnes J, Schueler B, Mauersberger K. (1990) Laboratory studies of heavy ozone. J Geophys Res 95:901–907.